Aliquid Novi: The New Series of Bolchazy-Carducci Latin Readers

Judith Lynn Sebesta
The University of South Dakota

Abstract

This article discusses the new series of Bolchazy-Carducci Readers (BCReaders), using the eight volumes so far released. It evaluates these readers in terms of their targeted student audience and also a potential audience of advanced secondary students whose teachers are looking for ideas to replace the now defunct second Latin AP course; the series' goal to broaden the canon of authors generally read in college courses; the level of help provided by the commentaries; other features of the readers; and the rationale for how the selections were chosen for each volume. The article also offers three examples of how these volumes can be used with one another and one example of how a volume can be used with another textbook. Each example offers four to five topics to use in a classroom, useful websites, and a bibliography for assigned student readings. Appendices catalogue the passages included in the currently published BCReaders; and list forth-coming BCReaders.

Key words: Latin pedagogy, Latin readers, Latin textbooks, Latin literature, Latin genre, teaching Latin authors, Bolchazy-Carducci

Texts Reviewed

Anderson, William S. *A Terence Reader: Selections from Six Plays*. Bolchazy-Carducci Publishers. Mundelein, IL. 2009. 978-0-86516-678-3. Paper. $19.00.

Braund, Susanna. *A Lucan Reader: Selections from Civil War*. Bolchazy-Carducci Publishers. Mundelein, IL. 2009. 978-0-86516-661-5. Paper. $19.00.

Henderson, John. *A Plautus Reader: Selections from Eleven Plays*. Bolchazy-Carducci Publishers. Mundelein, IL. 2009. 978-0-86516-694-3. Paper. $19.00.

Jaeger, Mary. *A Livy Reader: Selections from Ab Urbe Condita*. Bolchazy-Carducci Publishers. Mundelein, IL. 2009. 978-0-86516-680-6. Paper. $19.00.

Keane, Catherine C. *A Roman Verse Satire Reader: Selections from Lucilius, Horace, Persius, and Juvenal*. Bolchazy-Carducci Publishers. Mundelein, IL. 2010. 978-0-86516-685-1. Paper. $19.00.

Osgood, Josiah. *A Suetonius Reader: Selections from the Lives of the Caesars and the Life of Horace.* Bolchazy-Carducci Publishers. Mundelein, IL. 2009. 978-0-86516-716-6. Paper. $19.00.

Pagán, Victoria E. *A Sallust Reader: Selections from Bellum Catilinae, Bellum Iugurthinum, and Historiae.* Bolchazy-Carducci Publishers. Mundelein, IL. 2009. 978-0-86516-687-5. Paper. $19.00.

Williams, Craig. *A Martial Reader: Selections from the Epigrams*. Bolchazy-Carducci Publishers. Mundelein, IL. 2011. 978-0-86516-704-9. Paper. $19.00.

What textbooks to use with secondary or college students that have just completed their beginning Latin textbook? For more advanced students, what textbooks to use that will assist them to understand more difficult texts/authors? For all students, what textbooks to use that will give them the needed background information on Roman culture, history, personages, etc. so that they may complete the course with some knowledge of Roman literature as well as more advanced Latin grammar? In selecting a reader (or readers) for a course, like many teachers I consider first the amount of help the commentary will provide my students, for, depending upon the level of this help, I will need to supplement explanations of grammar and stylistics and provide specialized or idiomatic vocabulary. Another item I consider is whether vocabulary is included at the back of the reader. Including a vocabulary is particularly helpful for intermediate students, as it guides them in selecting the best English meaning for the word because a certain number of reading difficulties and errors are caused by a student's selection of the wrong lexical meaning for the particular context. Grammatical explanations need to be concise but clear, so that a student can apply the explanation to the passage. Many older, reprinted readers were written for students who had studied Latin many years prior to college, and the grammatical explanations in these readers can be too austere or unhelpful for today's students—I recall using as a college student a reader that "explained" a Latin construction by citing some Greek passages as a comparison. Important, too, is the cultural and historical content in the commentary. Because an increasing number of classical studies majors begin their study of Latin in college, a commentary should provide students with a level of cultural literacy that enables them to understand more fully what they are reading.

A glance at the *Classical World* Textbook Survey shows that there are many Latin readers available, including at least one complete survey of Latin literature, and textbooks that offer thematic selections of several authors, or individual works of an author, or selections from several works of an author. With so many readers available, we might well ask what need(s) does the new series of Bolchazy-Carducci Readers (BCReaders) aim to fulfill? This article is an evaluation of the readers in terms of their targeted college student audience and a potential (albeit unstated) audience of advanced secondary students; their goal in broadening the canon of authors generally read in college courses; the level of help provided by the commentaries; and their rationale for how the selections were chosen for each volume. It then offers three examples of how these volumes can be used with one another and one example of how a volume can be used with another textbook. Finally, the article concludes with two appendices: the first catalogues the passages included in the currently published BCReaders; the second lists forth-coming BC Latin Readers.

Bolchazy-Carducci Publishers explains the rationale for developing these readers thus:

> *These readers, written by experts in the field, provide well annotated Latin selections to be used as authoritative introductions to Latin authors, genres, or topics, for intermediate or advanced college Latin study. Their relatively small size (covering 500-600 lines) makes them ideal to use in combination. Each volume includes a*

*comprehensive introduction, bibliography for further reading, Latin text with notes at the back, and complete vocabulary. Nineteen volumes are scheduled for publication; others are under consideration. (*http://www.bolchazy.com/readers)

At the 2011 CAMWS panel presenting the BCReaders, the series editor, Ronnie Ancona, further explained the two main aims of the series. First, the series aims to help expand advanced Latin curricula by providing selections and a commentary that meet the interests and needs of today's Latin students and teachers. Second, as the series aims for flexibility in use, each BCReader can be used by itself, in conjunction with others in the series, or even with other readers produced by other presses. Ancona noted that though the BCReaders are aimed at college level Latin classes, they have generated interest among "secondary school teachers looking to design their own courses, especially since the demise of the second AP Latin course."

Do the BCReaders, whether now published or scheduled for publication, expand the range of authors conventionally read in the college classroom? I searched course inventories of fifteen state universities and private institutions and found that though a number of them have single author courses (e.g. Vergil; Cicero), most also had courses devoted to a pair of authors (e.g. Catullus and Horace) and/or genre types of courses, such as Lyric Poetry, Latin Historians, or a "historical period" type of course (Augustan Poetry). Within all these courses there was a considerable range of authors. For example, a course in Roman Biography listed Nepos, Suetonius, Tacitus, the *Scriptores Historiae Augustae*, and Einhard, and a course in Roman Historians listed Caesar, Sallust, Ammianus Marcellinus "and others." While all of the Latin authors in the current BCReaders are listed in some of the surveyed course offerings, it does not follow that all these authors are read as quite possibly instructors can pick and choose among those listed. Of the projected readers (see Appendix 2), probably only Hoyos' *A Roman Army Reader* is on a topic not generally taught today. At present there is no volume on Pliny the Younger planned (e-mail from Ronnie Ancona, May 13, 2011), which is surprising, given that several of these schools teach a course in Pliny the Younger or on Latin Epistolography, and he would likely be included among the authors in literature survey courses. I also noted that a number of the surveyed programs teach a course in medieval Latin or St. Augustine, but currently a BCReader of Latin texts from late antiquity or the middle ages is not planned.

Instructors interested in teaching a one or two semester course surveying Latin literature will be pleased to find that the current and projected list of authors covers fairly well many of the authors for such a course: mid-Republic: Plautus, Terence, Lucilius (*Roman Verse Satire*); late Republic: Sallust, Cicero, Caesar; Augustan: Horace (*Roman Verse Satire*), Livy, Ovid, Tibullus, Propertius; Julio-Claudian: Lucan, Persius (*Roman Verse Satire*); late first/early second century: Tacitus, Suetonius, Martial, Juvenal (*Roman Verse Satire*), Apuleius. (The volume with selections from Latin epic will fill out this list a little more, as it includes selections from Statius, Silius Italicus, Lucretius, and Vergil.)

How well do the BCReaders meet the needs of their intended audience of intermediate or advanced Latin students? There are several facets to evaluating how well these needs are met. Authors of several volumes (Pagán x; Osgood vii-viii; Keane vii-viii; Jaeger viii) acknowledge in their prefaces that their draft manuscripts were tried out in college classes and profited by students' comments and suggestions. This "field testing" is a good way of evaluating the suitability of the draft commentary and where possible should be employed in future BCReaders.

Each volume contains an introduction to the author and his times, and, depending upon the volume, such topics as his literary works and their genre(s); cultural matters such as philosophy, religion and the supernatural; meter; style; grammar; orthography; influence or reception; and a bibliography titled "Suggested Reading." As the length of these introductions varies between thirteen and nineteen pages, the authors' difficult task is to provide *multum in parvo*. In general, they succeed very well, giving enough detail and background on the author and/or genre, historico-cultural matters such as philosophy and the different emperors, that students have a sufficient over-all perspective on the readings they will commence. Not all the BCReaders, however, include a section on reception. Given our profession's current degree of interest in classical reception, the inclusion of this topic in all author/genre readers is recommended.

Thirdly, examination of the commentaries indicates that their focus is on the most essential information that the student needs to read the selected passage. As students are beginning *in medias res*, so to speak, with each selection, they need background information on the preceding part of the work, which information is given in the introduction to each selected passage. This introduction may give the setting of the selection, e.g. what has gone on in a Plautine play before the selection. It may relate the selection to other parts of the work, e.g. how Horace *Satire* 2.7 relates to the other satires in the second book of his *Satires* and the first book as well. To determine how well one commentary provided essential information for the student to read the selected passage, I compared Pagán's commentary on Sallust's description of why he turned to writing history late in life, *Catiline* 3.3-3.5 (the first selection in the volume), with two other available editions (McGushin; Ramsey). Pagán's commentary is shorter than those in the other two volumes and goes into less stylistic and linguistic discussion and cultural background. Yet the omitted information can be covered in class by the instructor and is not, I think, so very necessary for a student's preparation for class. For example, the instructor can explain what Sallust refers to by *advorsa* and, in reference to *sicuti plerique,* the difficulty for an "outsider" like Sallust to be elected to the offices of quaestor, praetor, and consul. Pagán's commentary does give help that is essential for preparing a translation. It provides a translation for *initio* and notes that it is an ablative of time used as an adverb. It points out that *studio* is an ablative of means with *latus sum* and explains that "*Studium* is the hallmark of the dedicated historian, but in youth, Sallust's *studium* was misdirected towards politics (*rem publicam*)." This cultural information about *studium* helps the student understand Sallust's purpose in writing history since he can no longer participate in politics, but also prepares the student for Catiline's wrongly directed *studium* that prompts his conspiracy. Pagán's commentary on *nam…vigebant* points out the complexity of what Sallust is saying and the simplicity of his grammar, a hallmark of his style, thus preparing the student for the numerous examples in the other selections. The other two commentaries provide fuller discussion on a number of phrases, but an intermediate student (and many an advanced student as well) generally focuses more on "getting through and making sense" of a passage. More extensive comments on alternative readings, or comparisons with similar expressions or thoughts in other orations do not facilitate most students' basic preparation for class. These more extensive points can be taken up in class as the instructor deems useful or necessary. The commentaries in the BCReaders aim to provide sufficient help for construing and understanding in a basic way what is being read.

Lastly, a feature that Jaeger, Keane, and Osgood include in their commentaries is particularly useful for intermediate and advanced Latin students. They reference either (or both) *Gildersleeve's Latin Grammar* and *Bennett's New Latin Grammar*. Both intermediate and advanced students at this point in their Latin study should be learning how to use a Latin grammar and how

to locate the grammatical construction that is puzzling them. For idiomatic expressions, Jaeger includes references to the *OLD*, e.g. *uenisse* + dat. (*OLD* s.v. *uenire*, 15). Implementing these features in future commentaries would be beneficial to students.

How well do the BCReaders serve the needs of an audience of secondary school students not explicitly envisioned as a target audience by the publisher? Unlike some secondary readers, such as the Longman Latin readers (Arnold, Aronson, LaFleur, LaFleur and McKay, Lawall), the BCreaders do not include comprehension and discussion questions on the passages, which are extremely useful in giving students an overview of the content of a Latin selection and initiating class discussion on its content. As devising pedagogically helpful comprehension and discussion questions is not easily accomplished, the omission of such questions in these volumes makes them less immediately useful for teaching secondary students. Moreover, secondary school readers commonly include facing vocabulary, many more glosses and more grammatical notes, and fewer stylistic comments than the BCReaders' commentaries provide. Many secondary teachers will likely find that they need to produce more extensive notes on grammar, and, possibly, supplementary vocabulary lists for each section, for their students to use these readers.

How usefully are the books illustrated for students, whether college or secondary? The volumes generally have few illustrations, usually a map or diagram, a portrait bust of an emperor or other historical figure. Several illustrations, however, are worth mentioning in particular. In his Suetonius volume, Osgood, for example, has the new alphabet letters that Claudius devised. Jaeger includes in her volume of Livy a photo of *Senatus consultum de Bacchanalibus* in the Vienna Kunsthistoriches Museum. In her Roman satire volume, Keane presents a Pompeiian graffito of a victorious gladiator carrying a palm branch and a terracotta figurine of two comic actors playing a male slave and a *paterfamilias*. Williams illustrates his Martial with a mosaic depicting Ganymede being carried by Jupiter's eagle, the Isola Sacra necropolis near Ostia, and an Ostian public latrine. In his Plautus reader, Henderson provides the replica of a Roman stage set at the Getty Museum in Malibu, a Pompeiian fresco of a comic scene, and the modern British Panto(mime) characters of the Dame and the Principal Boy. Given the ease of finding on-line images in VRoma or downloading images from ARTstor or even from Wiki Images, finding further illustrations of places, people, cultural objects can be easily rectified, and even made into a student assignment.

Lastly, the volumes are inexpensive and, because they are bound well, the BCReaders will survive their use in a semester.

The main problem, of course, facing anyone producing a reader is what selections to choose. The series' requirement that the lines of Latin total between 500 and 600 certainly constrains choice, challenging editors to make interrelating selections truly interrelate. Sometimes editors' comments in the introduction explain why they made a particular selection. Jaeger (xvi) comments that Livy's

> *. . . focus on human behavior in all its variety largely determines Livy's treatment of religion. . . . His narrative shows Roman pietas and lapses in pietas influencing events rather than the gods acting in order to influence events.*

The selection from Livy's fourth decade on the Bacchic "conspiracy" is an example of a near lapse in *pietas*, which, fortunately for Rome, was discovered in time. This exotic cult, celebrated with debauchery, so contravened Roman traditional forms of worship that it was harshly

suppressed and magistrates required to set night watches to detect illegal meetings and attempted arson.

Some editors explain their rationales in their prefaces or introductions. Suetonius' thematic organization of biographies, Osgood observes, "facilitates comparison of one emperor against another" and so Osgood (xxiii) made his choices "to give you a sense of all the typical parts of the Suetonian life." Henderson (ix) explains that for his volume on Plautus, "There is no such creature as a typical Plautus play, but we have chosen excerpts that give a good sense of how a whole script runs, from opening call for hush (**1**) to final bow, and call for applause (**5**)—with two varieties of each." Throughout his introductory discussion he makes frequent reference to those sections that illustrate the reading of Plautus, e.g. stage scenery described by a character (**3A**) and the costuming of wigs, padding, masks (**4E**). In her volume on Roman satire, Keane (xxii) comments that

> *Without a doubt, ten different instructors would choose different lists of selections for a volume like this one. In making my choices I have aimed at various goals: to trace the broad changes in satire from the Republic to the high Imperial period; to show each author's range of themes and strategies; to draw attention to the ways the authors imitate and modify one another's work; and occasionally to train the spotlight on a poem that might not otherwise make it onto course syllabi.*

These rationales of choice are very interesting to read and very helpful in gaining an overall estimation of the possible themes an instructor might use in presenting the selections. In knowing why the editors selected these particular passages, students can become more understanding of the importance that commentaries and readers have in our profession and, one hopes, more appreciative of the scholarship and reflection required in producing them.

Because the number of lines of Latin in each volume is set between 500 and 600, a single volume is unlikely to suffice for a course, but this amount of Latin makes it easy—even encourages the instructor—to mix and match a BCReader with another BCReader or with readers published by other presses. Keane (xxiii) suggests additional Latin readings that are "class favorites" and useful reader sources for satirical verse and commentaries. She helpfully advises, "Verse satire would pair well with the comic drama of Plautus or Terence, with Martial's *Epigrams*, with Apuleius' novel *Metamorphoses*, or even with assorted sources on Roman women to build a syllabus dealing with Roman social and domestic life." Explanations and suggestions like these are very useful, to both students and instructors, assisting them to begin interrelating the readings in a volume. Keane's suggestions show that pairing of authors/genres can result in some intriguing combinations. Whether or not the suggestions below are equally intriguing, I hope that they sufficiently interest readers to devise pairings for their own classes.

Suggested Pairings

1. Teaching Roman Historians and Historiography: Livy and Sallust

An understanding of historiography, the methodology that a historian uses to write history, is essential in reading any Roman historian. Roman historical writing can be divided into two traditions, the annalistic tradition in which the historian writes about events year by year, and the monographic tradition, in which he examines a particular event or period. Examples of the annal-

istic tradition are Livy's *Ab Urbe Condita* and Tacitus' *Annales* and *Historiae*. The monographic tradition, which includes biography, is represented by Sallust's *Bellum Catilinae* (Pagán), Suetonius' *Lives of the Caesars* (Osgood), and Tacitus' *Agricola* (Rutledge). Whether writing annalistic or monographic history, the Roman historian, however, was writing "ethical" history which relates the effect of morals upon events; figures in history were held up as examples to readers of virtue and vice, excellence and degeneracy, honor and shame. What we call social history or economic history or cultural history was unknown to Roman historians. But, as recent dialogue on "American exceptionalism" shows, some continue to frame history in ethical terms (see e.g., Gingrich; Zinn).

Still, Roman historiography is generally unlike modern historical writing, which is supposed to be disinterested and unbiased. The Roman historian presented history as a vindication of Roman (im)morality or as confirming the political agenda of a particular political party. Unlike historians today, Roman historians did not hesitate to use their imagination to reconstruct details that support their interpretation of events and to craft speeches that give insight to the thoughts and motives of their characters. As Wiseman has commented (146), "The invention of circumstantial detail was a way to reach the truth."

Suggested course topics:

1. The Lives of the Authors. Students should know the background of both authors' lives, including where they were born and the political status of their birthplace (the plebeian Sallust was born at Amiternum in Sabine country, Livy at Patavium which then was part of the province of Cisalpine Gaul). They should also know about the historical events the authors lived through.

2. Roman Historiography. It is important for students to read Livy's preface, which explains how he approached his historical investigations. (I recommend that students read the rest of the preface in translation.) For example, in recounting the earliest years of Roman history (for which he found little historical verification), he states he found it sufficient to relate legendary stories without arguing about their truth or falsehood. (Of these legendary stories, Jaegar includes the founding of Rome (1.6.3-1.73), Horatius at the bridge (2.10.1-13), and Mucius Scaevola (2.12.1-16)). Livy observes that the study of history is rewarding because it gives clear examples of how the good and bad conduct of kings, generals, and political leaders influenced the course of history. Throughout his history, Livy's comments make clear that he did not always sift evidence or evaluate his sources, but preferred to side with what he deemed most likely to have happened or with the account presented by a predominant number of his sources. However, because Sallust wrote on an event that occurred in his lifetime, he was able to use eye-witness accounts (including his own) of Catiline's conspiracy as well as written sources such as Cicero's speeches and letters preserved in state archives. For this reason Sallust's accounts may seem to students closer to historical truth than those of Livy. To illustrate to students Livy's historiography, students can contrast Livy's *praefatio* 6-10 in which he explains how he views his sources and their accounts and the moralizing themes he expresses in his history with Sallust's introduction to the Catilinarian conspiracy which reveals how *he* moralizes history (Pagán, *Bellum Catilinae* 3.3-4.5). For Sallust, Catiline is a prime example of the moral degeneracy of Romans due to the wealth that flowed into Rome from its ever-expanding Roman empire, and the vices of greed, love of indulgence (*luxuria*) and selfish ambition that this wealth created.

3. The Use of Oratory by Roman Historians. Both historians include many speeches in their works. Jaeger has selected sections of the speeches of Scipio and Hannibal in book 21 and

the consul's speech on the Bacchic conspiracy in book 39. Pagán includes the speech of Marius in *Bellum Jugurthinum* 85. As Pagán notes (91), Roman historians do not give speeches verbatim or in part, but one that "approximates what the speaker is likely to have said, so as to convey not only the speaker's intentions, but also the historian's themes and attitudes." The speeches have several functions: charged with emotion, they engage the reader more deeply in the narrative; they serve to give insight into the speakers' characters; and, if paired against the speech of another, they dramatize the issues almost as a duel between the two speakers (Miller, Skard, Walsh, Woodman). In order to understand better the use of speeches by the authors, students need to be familiar with the rhetorical training elite Roman men received and be able to identify rhetorical figures of speech in the selections they read.

   4. Gender and historiography. Students should also consider how the two historians use gender to slant readers' views of events and protagonists. Pagán includes Sallust's portrait of Sempronia, who plays a minor role in Catiline's conspiracy but epitomizes the moral corruption of the Republic, and Jaeger the passages on Hispala Faecenia, who has a major role in the Bacchic "conspiracy," and only reveals the conspiracy to the consul Albinus under threat of punishment. Barbara Weiden Boyd has pointed out that Sallust employs the *topos* that a woman is treacherous when she acts outside her domestic sphere and argues that despite the fact that Sallust devotes only a single paragraph to Sempronia, she is "both thematically appropriate to and structurally significant for the greater concerns of Sallust's monograph" (Boyd 185). Adele Scafuro has discussed the relationship of the individual to the state, a relationship that is pertinent to Hispala Faecenia, in her article "Livy's comic narrative of the Bacchanalia." Useful too is Pagán's examination of Hispala Faecenia and Sempronia in her volume on conspiracy narratives. Francesca Santoro-L'Hoir analyzes the intersection of gender vocabulary and rhetoric in her volume, *The Rhetoric of Gender Terms: "Man," "Woman," and the Portrayal of Character in Latin Prose*.

2. Contrasting Two Civil Wars: Sallust and Lucan

   Though certainly Catiline's insurrection did not quite become a civil war because it was so quickly aborted, a number of those Romans who had lived through the wars of Marius and Sulla likely feared it would become one, and so it is not inappropriate to join Sallust's work with Lucan's *Civil War*, a civil war that resulted in radical political change. These two works give students the opportunity to read both historical prose and epic poetry and to contrast the authors' use of rhetoric in their speeches and *sententiae*.

   Suggested course topics:

   1. The Lives of the Authors. It is essential for understanding the background of both works that students have a reasonably detailed understanding of the events from the Gracchi through the war between Caesar and Pompey and an understanding of the breakdown of the Sullan constitution, which allowed the rise of Crassus and Pompey, gave Catiline reason to think that he, too, could exploit the political situation, and ultimately led to the First Triumvirate. In the lengthy introduction to his *Catiline*, Sallust gives some autobiographical details that, not surprisingly, show him in good light. Students should contrast his autobiography with what we know about his life and his relationship with Caesar, a relationship that students must take into account as they read Sallust's passages dealing with Caesar. Suetonius' *Life of Lucan* (http://www.thelatinlibrary.com/suetonius/suet.lucan.html) is short enough that it can be read in Latin in a single class period, and, as a class project, students can write a short commentary on it. (See suggestion 5 "Reading further in Latin" under "Roman Comedy" below.) Students should be cognizant of Lucan's relationship with the

two Senecas and Martial and have some idea of what was the life and culture of Spain during the Neronian and Flavian periods.

    2. Historiography and Poetry. Quintilian (*Inst. Orat.* 10.1.31) compares history to poetry, in particular their purposes and their use of language:

> *Historia quoque alere oratorem quodam uberi iucundoque suco po-*
> *test. Verum et ipsa sic est legenda ut sciamus plerasque eius virtutes*
> *oratori esse vitandas. Est enim proxima poetis, et quodam modo*
> *carmen solutum est, et scribitur ad narrandum, non ad probandum,*
> *totumque opus non ad actum rei pugnamque praesentem sed ad me-*
> *moriam posteritatis et ingenii famam componitur: ideoque et verbis*
> *remotioribus et liberioribus figuris narrandi taedium evitat.*

    Cicero (*de Leg.* 1.4-5), moreover, points out that those writing history and poetry use different laws, but that it is more proper for an orator to write history than poetry. It may surprise students that Quintilian sees history as a kind of a poem, but the relationship between history and poetry in Roman literature is a topic worth exploring with them. The volume of collected essays, *Clio and the Poets*, edited by Levine and Nelis, provides several articles readable by students. In "Epic Encounters? Ancient historical battle narratives and the epic tradition," Rhiannon Ash discusses Vergil, *Aeneid* 7.37-44; Sallust, *Catilina* 60.4-7; and Tacitus, *Historiae* 2.22. In the same volume Timothy P. Wiseman ("History, Poetry, and *Annales*") analyzes Livy, *praef.* 6-7 and 1.16.4; Cicero, *de Legibus* 1.1-5; Dionysius of Halicarnassos 1.77.1-3; and Varro, frr. 7, 10.

    3. Use of Rhetorical Characterization: Sallust's lurid picture of Catiline as a man given over to *superbia, crudelitas, avaritia*, and other vices has generally been followed unquestioningly by subsequent historians and authors (Wilkins). Though Livy depicts Hannibal as also possessing these vices, the Romans did have a somewhat grudging respect for him as their greatest adversary, and Polybius portrays him more sympathetically in his histories (Leigh). Dunkle has pointed out that the portraits of Catiline, Hannibal, and several of the Roman emperors, given by Catiline, Livy, and Tacitus respectively, are closely connected with the theatrical and rhetorical stock character of the tyrant. For this reason, students should have an understanding of the cultural importance of *declamatio* in Roman culture and education. The essays contained in *A Companion to Roman Rhetoric*, eds. William Dominik and John Hall, offer clear and deep discussion of this topic and are suitable for students to read; of particular pertinence are "Rhetorical Education and Social Reproduction in the Republic and Early Empire" by Anthony Corbeill and "Roman Oratorical Invective" by Valentina Arena. Also of interest is Rossi's analysis of how Livy frames Hannibal and Scipio as parallel lives and how he "sets up an exemplary antithesis between Rome's past *virtus* and her present decline."

3. Teaching a Genre: Roman Comedy

    A course focusing on the plays of Terence and Plautus and their influence in western literature affords students the opportunity to work with spoken Latin, and to gain some knowledge of manuscript tradition. Since the Middle Ages both authors have been favorite student texts, Plautus because of his humor and despite the fact that his dialogue is challenging with colloquialisms, puns, and comic word inventions, and Terence because of his humanity and clarity in dialogue. President John Adams, in fact, thought that the young should read Terence, commenting that "Ter-

ence is remarkable, for good morals, good taste, and good Latin. . . . His language has simplicity and an elegance that make him proper to be accurately studied as a model" (McCullough 259).

Suggested course topics:

1. Definition and Characteristics of Comedy. Some attention in the class can be given to the genre of Comedy, including questions such as: How do the people generally define comedy vs. the literary definition? What are the various kinds of comedy (e.g. satire, parody, comedy of manners)? What means do writers of comedy employ and, since several of these means (surprises, reversals, conflict) are used in tragedy, what are the differences in their employment in comedy and tragedy? (Goldberg 1980, 13-28; Lowe 23-29, 51-57, 65-72) (For a vocabulary of comedy, see http://www3.dbu.edu/mitchell/comedydi.htm/.)

2. Characterizing the Audiences and Comedies of Plautus and Terence. Traditional New Comedy used the prologue to give the audience enough background to the play to follow its exposition, cluing the spectators in to the double meanings, mistaken conclusions of characters, and the like so that the audience could enjoy the irony, and even, at times, hinting towards how the comedy will end. Varro (*Men*. 399) praised Plautus for his comic exuberance in word play, and Terence for his excellence in delineating his characters (*in ethesin Terentius, in sermonibus Plautus*). In the past, modern scholars have viewed Plautus as more successful than Terence, noting that on one occasion Terence's audience left to watch some gladiators. Holt Parker, however, in his excellent article "Plautus vs. Terence: Audience and Popularity Re-Examined" (592), argues on the basis of close study of ancient testimonia that Terence was "not just a successful comic playwright; he was more successful than any other playwright of his generation, more successful than the writer of any previous generation (including Plautus) and possibly the most successful writer of *palliatae* in the entire history of the Roman stage." This article, as suggested below, can be used to prompt student discussion of the comedies of Plautus and Terence.

In his edition of Plautus, Henderson includes two versions of the prologue to the *Poenulus*, Anderson the prologue to the *Adelphoe*. By reading closely these two introductions, students can draw some conclusions about what kind of audience the authors were playing to. As they read the other selections in the two BCReaders, students can identify the various methods each author used to create comic effect and keep the audience engaged and consider what effect the background of each author had on the characteristics of the plays he wrote, e.g. types of characters—the clever slave, the bragging soldier, the hen-pecked husband, and make connections with modern use of "stock" characters, for example, comedy films set on college campuses, which have the nerd, the smooth frat playboy, the anarchic drunken frat brother, and the scheming girl "friend." Students can be assigned to read the ancient testimonia about the two playwrights and two or three items of modern scholarship that present the traditional view of Plautus' greater success before reading Holt Parker's article. (Suggested readings: Chalmers, Gilula, Goldberg 1986, Grant, Gratwick, Greenberg, Handley, Sandbach.) On the basis of their own reactions to and their comic analysis of the BCReaders' selections of Plautine and Terentian comedies, students can discuss whether they agree with Varro's estimation before critiquing modern arguments on the relative success of the two playwrights. An important feature of undergraduate education is for students to see how scholars, using the same evidence, come to their conclusions, indeed sometimes quite opposite conclusions while using the same evidence to support their arguments.

3. Bringing Roman comedy to life. Once students have learned why, when, and where these Roman comedies were performed and what were the conventions of the Roman stage in terms of scenery and set-up, they can stage scenes excerpted in the BCReader or view the production of

Plautus' *Poenulus* in Latin, as acted by students of the University of North Carolina (Starks et al.) Students, moreover, can act a translated scene from Plautus or Terence of a play included in the Henderson or Anderson volumes, designing the set and movement of the actors.

4. Classical Reception. The reception of Plautus can be explored, *inter alia*, through Shakespeare's *Comedy of Errors* and the classic Broadway comedy, *A Funny Thing Happened on the Way to the Forum* (available in video from Amazon or, excerpted, on YouTube). Terence's more restrained comedies of manners have influenced many authors, including the Benedictine nun Hrotswitha of Gandersheim (ca. 935-1000 CE) (Damen, Jeffrey, Pascal). (For translations of several of Hrotsvitha's plays, see http://home.infionline.net/~ddisse/hrotsvit.html.) The web site, *Latin with Laughter: Terence through Time* (http://www.umilta.net/terrance.html) has links to an illustrated manuscript of Terence from 1493 and an early twelfth-century manuscript at Tours, two of Hrotswitha's plays, and several e-book essays on the reception of Terence. Attention can also be given to the reception of Terence by black writers, beginning with Phyllis Wheatley (the earliest one that I know of who refers to Terence as a black poet), who, on the basis of his cognomen *Afer* and his birth in North Africa (in the area of modern Libya) claim him as one of the earliest African poets (http://docsouth.unc.edu/neh/wheatley/wheatley.html/).

5. Reading further in Latin. Fortunately, we have available through the on-line Latin Library Suetonius' biography of Terence (http://www.thelatinlibrary.com/suetonius/suet.terence.html), (though, unfortunately, no biography for Plautus). Terence's biography is short and readable by students with more or less help from the instructor. It is ideal for the type of cooperative learning project sometimes called the "jigsaw group puzzle" in which groups work on discrete parts of an assignment. In this assignment, each section of the *vita Terenti* is given to a small group required to produce not only a translation of that section, but also provide vocabulary and grammatical commentary. The task may also require each group to reference grammatical constructions to a Latin grammar such as Allen and Greenough. Equally important, the student groups should provide commentary for historical, geographical, cultural, etc. references in their section of the *vita Terenti*. Such references range from various peoples in North Africa, and the location on the Via Appia of Terence's villa, to Menander and New Comedy, dating using consulships, and the *compitalia*. Where possible students can download from a repository such as ARTstor for maps, illustrations of northern Africa, the Via Appia, and the like. This part of the assignment requires students to become familiar with some aspects of Roman life, history, and culture and to learn something of the scholar's task of preparing commentary for readers of a text; my students have found such an assignment a welcome change from the standard research paper. Work on this project can be done during some class meetings, with the teacher assisting groups as needed.

4. Teaching a historical period: Martial and Pliny

As mentioned earlier, no Pliny BCReader is currently planned. I include Pliny as an example of how a BCReader can be used with another reader. (Currently available textbooks are Sebesta and Sherwin-White.)

In this approach, two or more authors from a particular period help students gain a better idea of the history and/or culture of that period, e.g., Martial and Pliny and the late first/early second century CE. The degree of their acquaintance is hard to establish, but Pliny at least knew of Martial's work, which he praised as both witty and good-natured (*Ep. iii. 2*, included in both Sebesta and Sherwin-White).

The two authors present contrasting views of their contemporaries. Martial writes about types of people, bringing to our attention, for example, the boorish (BCReader Epigrams 1.20, 2.37) and the ridiculous (BCReader 1.72, 2,62, 3.43) Romans of his day. He introduces us to Roman types of people we all have met or know about: those that flatter unashamedly to gain some favor or money (BCReader 1.10, 2.26, 4.56, 6.63) and husbands and wives at (sometimes murderous) odds with each other (BCReader 4.24, 9.15). His poems on the Flavian Amphitheatre (BCReader *Liber spectaculorum* 1, 2, 7) illustrate how authors like Martial were required to fawn on a man who exercised unlimited control over his subjects, and little or no control over himself. Though earlier Romans wrote epigrams on various topics to while away their time, Martial elevated this poetic form to literary quality and modified his verses so as to have a satiric or sarcastic punch. Pliny carefully composed and ordered his letters for publication, so that they are also a literary reflection on contemporary Roman society. Pliny writes not about types, but about individuals. Pliny's letters are about occasional topics, such as a reflection on an anecdote comparing his literary reputation with that of Tacitus (*Ep.* 9.23), or the remarkably friendly dolphin of Hippo (*Ep.* 9.33), or a frightening eyewitness account such as the eruption of Vesuvius (*Ep.* 6.16, 20) (all included in both Sebesta and Sherwin-White). The reliability of Martial and Pliny as sources about the crudity and cruelty, credulity and charity that existed in Roman society of this period rests in part upon their creating credible *personae* (self-representation) through their writings. This process is a complex one, as Craig Williams points out in his introduction (xix-xx):

> *Arguably the most prominent character in Martial's poetry is Martial himself, or rather the persona he adopts as the speaker or narrator . . . . [His] stance is often straightforwardly autobiographical . . . . [There are] some significant internal contradictions. Sometimes, for example, Martial writes in the voice of the unmarried man and confirmed bachelor, sometimes . . . as an experienced husband . . . . We sometimes find contradictory attitudes as well . . . . It is not coincidental that Martial never adopts a perspective or plays a role that would be seriously shaming or otherwise risky for him as a Roman man living in his social circles.*

As for Pliny, Jaqueline Carlon (8) comments that

> *. . . much recent work has focused on Pliny's letters as a vehicle for presenting himself as a model, both for his contemporaries and for posterity . . . recent examinations have made clear that the function of the letters in his self-representation begins with the very first letter of the collection, where he asserts that the arrangement of the letters is entirely incidental, implying that they recount ordinary, everyday events in his life and thus properly represent his behavior and character.*

Suggested course topics:

1. Building Historical Understanding of the Period. Martial resided in Rome between 64 CE and 98 CE, when he returned home to Spain. Not quite a generation younger, Pliny entered public life in 81 CE and assumed his last government position in 110 as governor of Bithynia and Pontus; he died ca. 112 CE. It is important for students to understand the character of the reigns

during which these authors lived. Students can read in translation Suetonius' *Life of Domitian* for details of his cruelty and caprice; two selections (*Dom.* 12, 18) of this life, it should be noted, are included in Osgood's BCReader.

2. The Lives of the Authors. Students should know that Martial was an immigrant from Spain (as were the elder and younger Seneca and Lucan) and should have some knowledge of the history and Romanization of that province. Important also for their reading of both authors is a familiarity, *inter alia*, with the social structure of Rome at that time. Students should be aware of Pliny's higher social status, his rise from *eques* to senator, etc., and the fact that he managed to accomplish this rise under several emperors, including Domitian. Students should be aware of what important political and literary figures the two authors had as mutual acquaintances (e.g. Silius Italicus, Quintilian).

3. The Concept of a Persona. While the concept of the *persona* is one that students are in actuality familiar with and very engaged in creating for themselves, they may not consciously think of themselves as creating "*personae*" through Facebook, Twitter, or their interactions with friends—or in their applications for a job or graduate school. Class discussion can focus on the concept of an author's *persona* and how s/he creates it. As the class reads the poems and letters, they can continuously refine their views on what kind of *personae* Martial and Pliny create and what were their motivations in doing so. Discussion can expand to contemporary authors who have used memoirs and autobiography to create their *personae*, such as President Obama and his *Dreams from My Father*, or Sarah Palin and her *Going Rogue*.

4. The Depiction of Women. Martial, of course, writes of women of all ranks of society, with biting satire. (For articles on women in Martial's poetry, see: Colton, Hallett, and Marino. Epigrams concerning women in the Martial reader include: 1.10, 1.13, 1.33, 1.34; 2.26; 4.24; 7.14; 8.12; 9.15; 10.8; 11.15; 12.20, 12.23, 12.93.) Pliny restricts himself to women of his elite status and even when he disapproves of their conduct, as in the case of Umidia Quadratilla (*Ep.* vii.24), his reproof is mild. Selections from Carlon's recent book, *Pliny's Women: Constructing Virtue and Creating Identity in the Roman World,* provide essential reading here and will give students an idea both of how prosopographical research and literary research complement each other and of how our understanding of Pliny's social circle is deepened by "a comprehensive examination of the women in the letters, focused particularly on their identities and the ways in which they serve Pliny's primary goals—preserving his *gloria* and securing *aeternitas* (3-4)." (On Pliny's depiction of women, see also Dobson.)

The above four suggestions and those made by Keane (quoted above) illustrate the potential versatility of this series of readers. The authors' expertise about their particular Latin writer or genre and their ability to keep in mind the needs of intermediate and advanced college students to read the passages have resulted in textbooks that can be used in multiple ways and combinations in courses that focus on "Latin Epistolography," "Golden Age literature," or authors courses such as "Catullus and Horace." The authors of these initial eight volumes are to be commended for inaugurating so exemplarily the BCReaders textbook series.

Works Cited

Ancona, Ronnie. "Latin in Small Packages: Expanding and Varying Advanced Latin Curricular Offerings." CAMWS Annual Meeting, Panel 12F. 6 Apr. 2011. Abstract. http://www.camws.org/meeting/2011/program/abstracts/12F.Panel.Ancona.Keith.Osgood.Ker.May.doc.

Arnold, B., A. Aronson, and G. Lawall. *Love and Betrayal* (selections from Catullus). Boston, MA: Pearson Prentice Hall, 2000.

Aronson, A. *Selections from Caesar's de Bello Gallico*. Boston, MA: Pearson Prentice Hall, 1994.

Boyd, Barbara Weiden. "*Virtus effeminata* and Sallust's Sempronia." *Transactions of the American Philological Association* 117 (1987) 183-201.

Briscoe, J. "The First Decade." *Livy*. Ed. T. A. Dorey. London: Routledge, 1971. 1-20.

Burck, E. "The Third Decade." *Livy.* Ed. T. A. Dorey. London: Routledge, 1971. 21-46.

Carlon, Jaqueline. *Pliny's Women: Constructing Virtue and Creating Identity in the Roman World.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009.

Chalmers, W. R.. "Plautus and his Audience." *Roman Drama*. Ed. T. A. Dorey and D. R. Dudley. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1965. 21-50.

Colton, R. E. "Juvenal and Martial on Women Who Ape Greek Ways." *Classical Bulletin* 50 (1973-74): 42-44.

Damen, Mark. "Hrotsvit's Callimachus and the Art of Comedy." *Women Writing Latin, vol. 2: Medieval Women Writing Latin*. Ed. L. Churchill, P. Brown, and J. Jeffrey. New York and London: Routledge, 2002. 37-91.

Dobson, E. S. "Pliny the Younger's Depiction of Women." *Classical Bulletin* 58 (1982): 81–85.

Dominik, William, and John Hall, eds., *A Companion to Roman Rhetoric*. Malden, Mass.: Blackwell, 2007.

Dunkle, J. R. "The Rhetorical Tyrant in Roman Historiography." *Classical World* 65 (1971): 12-20.

Gilula, D. "Who's Afraid of Rope-Walkers and Gladiators? (Ter. Hec. 1-17)." *Athenaeum* 59 (1981): 29-37.

Gingrich, Newt. *A Nation Like No Other: Why American Exceptionalism Matters.* Washington, D.C.: Regnery Publishing, 2011.

Goldberg, Sander. *The Making of Menander's Comedy*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1980.

————. *Understanding Terence*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1986.

Grant, J. N. "The Ending of Terence's Adelphoe and the Menandrian Original." *American Journal of Philology* 96 (1975): 42-60.

Gratwick, A. S. "Drama." *Cambridge History of Classical Literature. Part II: Latin Literature.* New York and Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982. Plautus 95-115, Terence 116-127.

Greenberg, N. A. "Success and Failure in the *Adelphoe*." *Classical World* 13 (1979/80): 221- 36.

Hallett, Judith. "Martial's Sulpicia and Propertius' Cynthia." *Woman's Power, Man's Game: Essays in Honor of Joyce K. King*. Wauconda, IL: Bolchazy-Carducci Publishers, 1993. 322-353.

Handley, E. W. "Plautus and his Public: Some Thoughts on New Comedy in Latin." *Dioniso* 46 (1975): 117-32.

LaFleur, Richard. *Love and Transformation: An Ovid Reader*. 2d ed. Boston, MA: Pearson Prentice Hall, 1999.

LaFleur, Richard and A. McKay. *A Song of War: Readings from Vergil's Aeneid* (sel. bks. 1, 4, 6, 10, 12; bk. 2 entire). Boston, MA: Pearson Prentice Hall, 2003.

Lawall, Gilbert. *Carpe Diem: A Horace Reader*. Boston, MA: Pearson Prentice Hall, 2006.

Leigh, M. *Comedy and the Rise of Rome.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005.

Levine, David S., and Damien P. Nelis, eds. *Clio and the Poets: Augustan Poetry and the Tradition of Ancient Historiography.* Boston, MA: Brill, 2002.

Lowe, N. J. *Comedy*. New Survey in the Classics, no. 37. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008.

Marino, P. A. "Women. Poorly inferior or richly superior." *Classical Bulletin* 48 (1971): 17-21.

McCullough, David. *John Adams*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 2001.

McGushin, Patrick, ed. *Sallust. Bellum Catilinae*. Bristol, England, and Oak Park, IL: Bristol Classical Press and Bolchazy-Carducci Publishers, 1980.

Miller, N. P. "Dramatic Speech in the Roman Historians." *Greece & Rome* 22 (1975): 45-57.

Pagán, Victoria E. *Conspiracy Narratives in Roman History*. Austin: University of Texas Press, 2004.

Parker, Holt N. "Plautus vs. Terence: Audience and Popularity Re-Examined." *American Journal of Philology* 117.4 (1996): 586-617.

Pascal, P. *Hrotsvitha: Dulcitia and Paphnutius*. Bryn Mawr Classical Commentary. Indianapolis, IN: Hackett Publishing Co., 1985.

Ramsey, John T., ed. *Sallust's Bellum Catilinae*. Chico, CA: Scholars Press, 1984.

Rossi, Andreola. "Parallel Lives: Hannibal and Scipio in Livy's Third Decade." *Transactions of the American Philological Association* 134.2 (Autumn, 2004): 359-381.

Sandbach, F. H. "How Terence's *Hecyra* Failed." *Classical Quarterly* 32 (1982): 134-35.

Santoro-L'Hoir, Francesca. *The Rhetoric of Gender Terms: "Man," "Woman," and the Portrayal of Character in Latin Prose*. Leiden: Brill, 1992.

Scafuro, Adele. "Livy's comic narrative of the Bacchanalia." *Helios* 17 (1990): 51-70.

Sebesta, Judith Lynn. *Selected Letters of Pliny*. Amherst, MA: CANE Instructional Materials, 1995.

Sherwin-White, A. N. *Fifty Letters of Pliny*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2d ed., 1969.

Skard, E. "Marius' Speech in Sallust, Jug. Chap. 85." *Symbolae Osloenses* 21 (1941): 98-102.

Starks, John H. Jr., Matthew D. Panciera, Christopher Brunelle, et al. *Latin Laughs: A Production of Plautus' Poenulus*. Video of performance. Mundelein, IL: Bolchazy-Carducci Publishers, 1999.

Walsh, P. G. "Making a Drama out of a Crisis: Livy on the Bacchanalia." *Greece & Rome,* ser. 2, 43 (1996): 188-203.

Wilkins, A. T. *Villain or Hero: Sallust's Portrayal of Catiline*. New York: Peter Lang, 1994.

Wiseman, Timothy P. "Lying Historians: Seven Types of Mendacity." *Lies and Fiction in the Ancient World*, eds. C. Gill and Timothy Wiseman. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1993. 122-146.

Woodman, A. J. *Rhetoric in Classical Historiography: Four Studies*. Portland, OR: Areopagitica Press, 1988.

Zinn, Howard. "The Myth of American Exceptionalism." *Myths of America* Lecture Series. MIT. Cambridge, MA, 14 March 2005. Lecture. http://www.informationclearinghouse.info/article8632.htm

APPENDIX 1. PASSAGES IN THE PUBLISHED BCReaders

Anderson, William S. *A Terence Reader: Selections from Six Plays*.

- *Andria* 28-139 "Starting the Plot".
- *Heautontimoroumenos* 175-256 "Complications".
- *Phormio* 1-12; 884-989 "Plot Summary and Vigorous Ending".
- *Hecyra* 198-228 "Misunderstandings".
- *Eunuchus* 539-614 "Characterization".
- *Adelphoe* 1-25; 787-881 "Prologue and Ending".

Braund, Susanna. *A Lucan Reader: Selections from Civil War*.

- 1.1-45 "Lucan's theme"; 67-157 "The causes of the civil war"; 183-227 "Caesar at the Rubicon"; 486-504 "Rome is abandoned".
- 3.8-35 "Pompey is visited by the ghost of Julia"; 399-4454 "Caesar fells the sacred grove".
- 6.624-653 "The witch Erichtho prepares to perform a necromancy".
- 7.617-637 "The end of the battle of Pharsalia"; 647-682 "Pompey concedes defeat and leaves the battlefield"; 728-746 "Caesar on the battlefield"; 760-811 "Caesar on the battlefield (continued)".
- 8.542-636 "The death of Pompey"; 663-688 "The death of Pompey (continued)".
- 9.190-217 "Cato's funeral oration for Pompey"; 961-999 "Caesar at the site of Troy".

Henderson, John. *A Plautus Reader: Selections from Eleven Plays*.

- *Poenulus* 1-45 "Getting the Audience in on the Act".
- *Pseudolus* 1-2 "Plunging In".
- *Curculio* 462-486 "Rough Guide to the Roman Forum".
- *Poenulus* 541-566 "Backstage Onstage".
- *Pseudolus* 394-414 "The Cunning Slave, or Brains".
- *Menaechmi* 77-109 "The Parasite, or Smarm-on-legs—'Greaseball' ".
- *Cistellaria* 203-229 "Teenager in Love: The Loverboy".
- *Menaechmi* 351-369 "Drop-dead Gorgeous: The Babe".
- *Truculentus* 482-548 "Outmaneuvered: The Soldier and the Whore".
- *Casina* 780-854 "Invitation to a Wedding: Comedy Gets Married".
- *Asinaria* 746-809 "The Foolproof Contract: Scriptwriting Onstage".
- *Rudens* 938-1044 "The Tug of War: Finders and Keepers".
- *Amphitruo* 361-462 "The Slave Meets His Match: Identity Theft".
- *Captivi* 1029-1036 "Clap Now".
- *Casina* 1012-1018 "Or Else".

Jaeger, Mary. *A Livy Reader: Selections from Ab Urbe Condita*.

- *Praefatio* 6-10 "From Livy's Preface".
- 1.6.3-7.3 "The Founding of Rome".
- 2.10.1-13 "Horatius at the Bridge"; 2.12.1-16 "Mucius Scaevola"; 2.13.6-11 "Cloelia".
- 7.9.6-10.14 "Manlius and the Gaul".

- 21.1.11-2.2 "The causes of the Second Punic War"; 21.35.4-12 "Hannibal crosses the Alps"; 21.40.6-11 "Scipio addresses his army"; 21.41.13-17 "Scipio concludes his speech"; 21.42-43.10 "Hannibal illustrates the nature of the situation"; 21.44.1-9 "Hannibal concludes his speech".
- 22.51.1-9 "The day after Cannae".
- 39.9.1-7 "The Beginning of the Bacchic Conspiracy"; 39.10.1-8 "The Bacchic conspiracy (continued)"; 39.13.1-14 "The magistrates learn of the conspiracy"; 39.15.1-14 "The consul's speech"; 39.16.1-13 "The consul's speech (continued)?.

Keane, Catherine C. *A Roman Verse Satire Reader: Selections from Lucilius, Horace, Persius, and Juvenal*.

- Lucilius, *Satires* fragments 172-175, 176-181, 185 "Scenes from a gladiatorial match"; 524-529 "Human superstition"; 1145-1151 "The Roman rat-race"; 1196-1208 "A definition of virtue".
- Horace, *Satires* 1.1.41-79 "Greed and its manifestations"; 1.14.103-143 "Horace defends his satire"; 2.5.23-50 "How to hunt legacies"; 2.7.21-71 "The satirist in the hot seat"; 2.7.111-118 "The satirist in the hot seat (continued)".
- Persius, *Satires* 1.1-12 "A self-sufficient satirist"; 1.107-34 "A self-sufficient satirist (continued)"; 2.1-16 "Foolish prayers" 31-51 "Foolish prayers (continued)"; 5.21-51 "The satirist's philosophical and ethical roots".
- Juvenal, *Satires* 1.63-93 "Identifying a crisis"; 1.135-146 "Identifying a crisis (continued)"; 3.190-231 "Trials of the urban poor"; 6.60-102 "Unchaste women on display"; 8.183-99 "The scandal of performing nobles"; 8. 215-230 "The scandal of performing nobles (continued)"; 13.38-70 "The good old days"; 14.1-55 "Parents who teach vice".

Osgood, Josiah. *A Suetonius Reader: Selections from the Lives of the Caesars and the Life of Horace*.

- *Iul*. 81.1-82.3 "The assassination of Julius Caesar".
- *Aug*. 78 "The work habits of Augustus"; 33 "The work habits of Augustus (continued)".
- *Tib*. 40-44 "Tiberius on Capri"; 60 "Tiberius on Capri (continued); 62.2 "Tiberius on Capri (continued)".
- *Gai*. 55 "Caligula's capers"; 45-46 "Caligula's capers (continued)".
- *Claud*. 41-42 "Claudius the scholar".
- *Ner*. 20-12 "Nero the artist".
- *Galb*. 2-3 "Galba's family".
- *Oth*. 2-3 "Otho's youth".
- *Vit*. 13 "Vitellius the glutton".
- *Vesp*. 21-22 "The work habits of Vespasian".
- *Tit*. 8.3-4 "Titus and the eruption of Vesuvius".
- *Dom*. 12 "Difficulties for Domitian"; 18 "Difficulties for Domitian (continued)".
- *Vita Horati*.

Pagán. Victoria E. *A Sallust Reader: Selections from Bellum Catilinae, Bellum Iugurthinum, and Historiae*.

- *Bellum Catilinae*: 3.3-4.5 "Sallust (re)turns to history"; 5.1-8 "The character of Catiline"; 15 "Catiline's sordid past"; 22 "Alleged human sacrifice"; 23-24 "Cicero learns of the conspiracy"; 25 "The portrait of Sempronia"; 27.2-29 "Catiline at Rome, Manlius in Etruria"; 40-41 "The Allobroges"; 53-54 "Cato and Caesar"; 60-61 "Catiline's last stand".
- *Bellum Iugurthinum*: 6-7 "The character of Jugurtha"; 17-19 "The African excursus"; 84 "Marius prepares for campaign"; 85 "The speech of Marius"; 86.1-3 "Marius enlists soldiers".
- *Historiae*: 2.70 "The banquet of Metellus".

Williams, Craig. *A Martial Reader: Selections from the Epigrams*. *Liber Spectaculorum* 1, 2, 7.

- *Epigrams Book 1*: 1, 2, 3, 6, 10, 13, 15, 16, 20, 24, 32-37, 47, 72, 93, 109, 110, 118.
- *Book 2*: 5, 11, 18-23, 26, 28, 30, 37, 44, 62, 80, 82.
- *Book 3*: 1, 27, 43.
- *Book 4*: 24, 56.
- *Book 5*: 58, 81, 83.
- *Book 6*: 1, 34.
- *Book 7*: 5, 10, 14.
- *Book 8*: 12, 17, 23, 55.
- *Book 9*: *Praefatio*; 15, 70.
- *Book 10*: 4, 8, 47.
- *Book 11*: 13-15, 70, 77.
- *Book 12*: 3, 20, 23, 68, 90-93.
- *Book 13*: 3, 4, 14, 29, 63, 74, 82, 108.
- *Book 14*: 73, 134, 188-191, 194, 195, 198-200, 203-205.

Appendix 2. BC Latin Readers in Preparation

Bowditch, P. Lowell. *A Propertius Reader: 11 Selected Elegies*. 978-086516-723-0.

Dickison, Sheila and Judith P. Hallett. *A Roman Women Reader: Selections from the 2nd Century BCE - 2nd Century CE*. 978-0-86516-662-2.

Finkelpearl, Ellen. *An Apuleius Reader: Selections from Metamorphoses*. 978-0-86516-714-8.

Hoyos, Dexter. *A Roman Army Reader: 21 Selections from Literary, Epigraphic, and Other Documents*. 978-0-86516-715-5.

Keith, Alison. *A Latin Epic Reader: Selections from 10 Epics*. 978-0-86516-686-8.

Ker, James. *A Seneca Reader: Selections from Prose and Tragedy*. 978-0-86516-758-2.

May, James. *A Cicero Reader: Selections from 5 Essays and 4 Speeches, with 5 Letters*. 978-0-86516-713-3.

Miller, Paul Allen. *A Tibullus Reader: Seven Selected Elegies*. 978-0-86516-724-7.

Newlands, Carole E. *An Ovid Reader: Selections from Six Works*. 978-0-86516-722-3.

Rutledge, Steven H. *A Tacitus Reader: Selections from Annales, Historiae, Germania, Agricola, and Dialogus* . 978-0-86516-697-4.

Tatum, W. Jeffrey. *A Caesar Reader: Selections from Bellum Gallicum and Bellum Civile, with Evidence on Caesar's Letters, Oratory, and Poetry*. 978-0-86516-696-7.