

Music, Meaning, and the Muses: Teaching Latin Intertextuality with Wild Nothing's "Paradise"¹

Christopher Trinacty
Oberlin College

ABSTRACT

This paper discusses how to utilize a music video to teach Latin intertextuality. It shows how to encourage students to be aware of the way authors and musicians establish connections between their own works and those of their predecessors. The video features "signposts" for allusive material and an extended quotation that enhances the meaning of the song. Similar effects can be discovered in the analysis of Latin poetry and a case study shows how intertextual echoes in Vergil adumbrate his own literary antecedents and his creative use of his source material. This instructional strategy not only assists students to see the larger context of the Latin poems and to delve into their poetics, but also illuminates how visual clues operate within Latin poetry.

KEYWORDS

Latin, video, pedagogy, music, intertextuality, allusion, Vergil

In order to teach Latin intertextuality, I often begin by talking about music with my students.² Musicians are always building upon, responding to, referencing, covering, and even sampling songs that have come before. Of course, not all of these are examples of intertextuality *per se*, but all of these traits position the music in a larger continuum of previous songs, genres, artists, keys, beats, and assume that the listener will be able to appreciate some of these references. This creates a relationship between the musician and the audience. No music is made in a vacuum

¹ I owe thanks to John Gruber-Miller and the readers of TCL for their thoughtful comments and suggestions. I also want to thank Justin Arft, who gave me the idea to write up some of my ideas about this topic, and the other panelists at the CAMWS 2017 session "Finding a New Beat: Teaching Latin Poetry with Popular Music."

² Helpful studies of Latin intertextuality include Hinds 1998, Edmunds 2001, and Hutchinson 2013. Although intertextuality has come to be a blanket term for any sort of borrowing, in this paper I will distinguish it from allusion in a more concrete manner. A nice collection of essays on connections between poetry and modern song writing is Robbins 2017.

and, likewise, no poetry can exist without previous poems.³ So, who determines the meaning? The audience or the author? This is one of the major divisions between allusion and intertextuality and forms part of the lesson that I teach with the song “Paradise” by the band Wild Nothing.

Broadly speaking, the term intertextuality refers to the dialogue between all types of texts/media and the meaning that is created by that very dialogue in the mind of the reader or listener (this is a strong “readerly” approach such as the literary critics Wolfgang Iser and Umberto Eco champion). As Andrew Laird helpfully clarifies, “Instances of irony, parody, or stylization in texts or utterances – which are manifestations of intertextuality – are notorious for not being evident to everyone... They are actualized only by readers or hearers with a certain competence” (1999: 38). Readers create the meaning and Latin authors clearly expected “Full-Knowing Readers.”⁴ Alternatively, allusion may be said to be the purposeful referencing of another’s material by an author (say, T.S. Eliot’s own notes to “[The Wasteland](#)”), in which the meaning is especially identified with authorial agency.⁵ For the purpose of this lesson, I try to make that distinction as clear as possible, and I find it can empower students to understand that their own interpretation of this dialogue can be as valid as what the author may have intended. Classical authors, of course, cannot be asked what they meant by a certain line or image (i.e. the “intentional fallacy,” which posits that only the author’s intention matters), but it would certainly be a strong misreading to read Seneca’s tragedies as panegyrics for tyrants or Juvenal’s satires as elucidations of Stoic physics.⁶

That classical authors were interested in placing themselves into a larger literary tradition is clear from the anecdotes related about their recitations, reading/writing habits, and claims in their work (such as Horace’s *exegi monumentum*, C. 3.30 and Ovid’s nod to it at the conclusion of his *Metamorphoses* 15.871-79). The concepts of *imitatio* and *aemulatio*, common in the rhetorical schools, show how important models were and how consciously writers imitated past works, often in the hope of surpassing them (West and Woodman 1979). The web of references

3 Even Homer’s *Iliad* is responding to previous oral traditions, e.g. Slatkin 1995.

4 As per the title of Pucci 1998.

5 See the introduction by Baraz and van den Berg to the special issue of *AJP*, “Intertextuality and its Discontents,” for a concise overview of the various theories.

6 cf. Bloom 1997 for such “misreadings” as part of the *Anxiety of Influence*, and Lethem 2011: 93-120 for the revisionist “ecstasy of influence” that, I would argue, is more helpful for students (and truer to the spirit of Latin intertextuality).

that can be present in any line of Vergil can be staggering – one need only lift one of Nicholas Horsfall’s weighty commentaries to sense this fact– and students often struggle to make sense of not only how these intertexts work, but also what they do for the larger meaning of the *Aeneid*. It is useful for students to realize also that their own music likewise has a strong intertextual tradition from [pop music](#) to [hip-hop](#). Bob Dylan looks back to Edgar Allen Poe (Rollason 2009), [Taylor Swift](#) references Shakespeare, and a Jay-Z/Kanye West track clearly evokes [Plato](#). An extreme example of this is DJ Danger Mouse’s [The Grey Album](#), a mash-up of The Beatles’ *White Album* and Jay-Z’s *The Black Album*, which exploits such creative appropriation in a way that students can immediately grasp.⁷ The “meaning” of Jay-Z’s music is blended with that of the Beatles in a way that creates something qualitatively different from either source yet still evocative of each. One can view its twelve songs much like the twelve books of the *Aeneid*, which graft aspects of Homer’s *Iliad* and *Odyssey* onto the myth of Aeneas’ wandering and settlement in Italy. Using “Paradise” in my class has helped my students understand intertextuality and visualize this process of appropriation by adding a music video to the mix.

Music videos work to offer an interpretation of the song and have their own sophisticated forms of reference. The pastiche technique of Spike Jonze, which can harken back to [Broadway musicals](#) or [Dirty Harry](#) films, proudly proclaims the tradition upon which it draws for both nostalgia and humor.⁸ Different genres of video such as “Pseudo-Documentary” and “Staged Performance” exist and often can be tweaked by subsequent bands, such as the [Red Hot Chili Peppers](#)’ homage to staged performances throughout the last 60 years.⁹ At times there can be a seeming disconnect between the song and its video, itself an evocative form of juxtaposition that can be easily identified by students when you ask if the actors from *Troy* or *Harry Potter* look the way you imagined when you read the book.¹⁰ I can only hear-

7 Fairchild 2014: 4 offers a readable take on this album and some of the intertextual issues involved, “over the last ten years or so a lot of other uses of music have also become theft, and in an increasing array of circumstances. Borrowing is theft. Appropriation is theft. Homage is theft. Allusion is theft. Derivation is theft. Quotation is theft. Even sharing is theft. *Sharing*.” (his emphasis).

8 For more on “pastiche” in music videos, cf. Goodwin 1992: 159-80 and Beebe 2007.

9 Such generic play is explored in Railton and Watson 2011: 41-65. See Vernallis 2004: 209-84 for close readings of three videos and Reiss 2000: 10-29 for a brief history of music videos and their ability to “harness...embedded and often deceptively sophisticated layers of texture and meaning into their veneer” which “elicit an open-ended response” (27).

10 Blondell 2009 humorously investigates the representation of Helen in her article ““Third cheerleader from the left’: from Homer’s Helen to Helen of Troy.”

ken back to my youth and that moment when I first heard Duran Duran's "[Hungry like the Wolf](#)" on Casey Kasem's Top 40 radio show; I certainly did not imagine a steamy Indiana-Jones-in-India love affair (as the video shows), but now that is all I can think of when I hear that song.¹¹ Students are often visual learners and, more and more, have a strong visual literacy for popular culture references and images. By tapping into the visual aspect of music videos, I believe this lesson helps to highlight various strategies for understanding intertextuality.

VISUAL AND AUDITORY INTERTEXTUALITY

A video from 2012 by the band Wild Nothing ("[Paradise](#)") is valuable for teaching some of primary tenets of intertextuality (I suggest you watch it now before reading the rest of this article). The video features the actress Michelle Williams flying from Australia to Niagara Falls, reading a book, and listening to her cassette Walkman (in itself a clever "archaic" nod indicating not only the band's musical influences but also a replaying of the past). The video as a whole is part of the "Narrative" genre, featuring a story tangentially related to the song, and it is shot in a way that evokes the 1980s through its color palate and videography. The song itself, heavy with synthesizers, evokes 1980s alternative music such as [Human League](#), [New Order](#), and [The Psychedelic Furs](#). The lyrics are relatively simple, aside from the long, spoken word section:

Dancer in the night
Playing with my eyes
Velvet tongue so sweet
Say anything you like

Crush me with the lie
And tell me once or twice
That love is paradise
That love is paradise

¹¹ Only later in life did I learn that Duran Duran were actually trying to be ironic in their glitzy videos, "Whenever we do something tongue in cheek, people think we're being more serious than we are. Like when we went to Rio to make that video on a boat, which we thought was a big joke, wearing silk shirts on a yacht, everybody thought Duran Duran was trying to put over a jet-set image." Quoted in Goodwin 1992: 164.

There are ways in which the video visually echoes these lyrics with Niagara Falls, a customary destination for weddings (especially in the 1970s and 1980s), and a shot of the main character on a dance floor. Her solitude and isolation are stressed throughout, however, in spite of the flash of an engagement ring during the video, which grants a degree of melancholy to the majority of the video. If love is to be understood as romantic love, “love is paradise” seems to be, primarily, a lie in the narrative context of the video.

What does this have to do with Latin intertextuality? In the course of the song, Williams performs a spoken word piece in which she conjugates the verb *amo*, *-are* and muses on its definitions and larger meaning:¹²

*Amo amas amat amamus amatis amant amavi amavisti
amavit amavimus amavistis amaverunt amavero amaveris
amaverit...Everything was love. Everything will be love.
Everything has been love. Everything would be love. Every-
thing would have been love. Ah, that was it, the truth at
last. Everything would have been love. The huge eye, which
had become an immense sphere, was gently breathing, only
it was not an eye nor a sphere but a great wonderful animal
covered in little waving legs like hairs, waving oh so gently
as if they were under water. All shall be well and all shall
be well said the ocean. So the place of reconciliation existed
after all, not like a little knothole in a cupboard but flow-
ing everywhere and being everything. I had only to will it
and it would be, for spirit is omnipotent only I never knew
it, like being able to walk on the air. I could forgive. I could
be forgiven. I would forgive. Perhaps that was the whole of
it after all. Perhaps being forgiven was just forgiving only
no one had ever told me. There was nothing else needful.
Just to forgive. Forgiving equals being forgiven, the secret
of the universe, do not whatever you do forget it. The past
was folded up and in the twinkling of an eye everything
had been changed and made beautiful and good. (Murdoch
1975: 298)*

¹² This is unique to the video and does not appear on the album version of the song. I often talk about such conjugation work as one of the building blocks for poetry itself and the lyrical musing here illustrates this point nicely.

This moment of Latin conjugation drew me to this song – after all, not many pop songs do this – but then I researched the spoken word piece further. This is actually an extended quotation from the very book Michelle Williams was reading on the plane, *A Word Child* by Iris Murdoch.¹³ The video features quick flashes of the book’s cover, and even the page number of the quotation. I believe these are visual equivalents to so-called “Alexandrian footnotes”¹⁴ and while they are featured only briefly, they are telling for the song’s larger meaning (in this way they have analogues in words such as *ferunt*, which can often pass by Latin learners without further thought). In essence, such “footnotes” help the reader understand that the author is referencing another work. These are obviously “allusions” as the director of the video (or the ancient poet) marks their appropriation through such a marker. What one makes of it, however, brings in the intertextual elements of the linkage. While this is a long quotation and most intertexts in Latin poetry feature merely a couple of words or an image that a later author recycles, I believe that this quotation forcefully shows the intertextual dialogue.¹⁵ Hearing the conjugation of the verb and settling on the definition “everything would have been love” highlights the changes in perspective on love in both the quotation and the song itself. This spoken word piece redefines the song, whose refrain is “love is paradise,” and the stream-of-consciousness reflection on the definition of love certainly transcends the banality of the chorus. This is similar to the way that intertexts will inform the larger meaning of a poem, supplementing the language to explore its very polyvalency. If the song seemed before to be an 80s throwback dance floor description (“Dancer in the night / Playing with my eyes / Velvet tongue so sweet / Say anything you like”), the Murdoch quote explores love as forgiveness and as a larger connection with the universe. This is spoken as clouds disintegrate outside the window of the airplane, a visual reminder of the god’s-eye point of view explored in Murdoch’s reverie.

13 This book’s protagonist, Hilary, is particularly adept at language and grammar, which he pursued at Oxford, and this moment touches on the novel’s larger concerns of love, hope, and forgiveness, cf. Howard 1992.

14 Stephen Hinds’ *Allusion and Intertext* mentions some signposts of allusion in Latin poetry such as *ferunt* (“they say”) and *fama est* (“the story goes”), and other “Alexandrian footnotes” (Hinds 1998: 1-5).

15 For a critical view of quotation and intertextuality, see the remarks of Worton and Still 1990: 11 “the reader inescapably strives to incorporate the quotation into the unified textuality which makes of the text of semiotic unit. The reader thus seeks to read the borrowing not only for its semantic content but also for its tropological or metaphoric function and significance.” Cf. Orr 2003: 130-67 for more on the theoretical distinction between quotation, intertext, imitation, and influence.

Forgiveness becomes paradise, paradise is somehow within our reach, and the heavenly visuals foster that interpretation.

I recognize that many students are visual learners and are particularly astute at interpreting visual media, and this exercise links the visual and the textual and encourages students to think of the text in somewhat visual terms.¹⁶ I would argue that Latin poets incorporate many other words and rhetorical devices to encourage the reader to pay attention and dig deeper. These can be placed in the poetic line in such a way to call attention to the poetic craft as well as to indicate that something “more” is happening. This can be important not only for issues such as concrete word order (or “word pictures” such as *Aen.* 8.369: *nox ruit et fuscis tellurem amplectitur alis*, where the land is embraced by Night’s dusky wings), but also for additional moments of poetic play (cf. the acrostics MARS at *Aen.* 7.601-4). The various visual signposts in this song not only hint at the generic influences at play in the music, but also the literary antecedents that are important to the songwriter. Another witty visual clue of the intertextual nature of the song is the tote bag that Williams carries, which says “[Shoplifters of the World Unite](#).” This refers to the famous song of that title by The Smiths, another band which often explores allusion, intertextuality, and even plagiarism (esp. in their song “[Cemetery Gates](#)”). The idea of allusion as theft is common in antiquity with the Latin term *furtum* used to denote such thefts. Suetonius tells us that Vergil’s detractors compiled books of the *Aeneid*’s *furta* which led to Vergil’s statement “Why don’t my critics also attempt the same thefts? If they do, they will realize that it is easier to steal the club from Hercules than a line from Homer” (*VSD* 46).¹⁷ Is Wild Nothing merely “shoplifting” 1980s street cred through the look of the video? Are they “shoplifting” Iris Murdoch? Was Vergil “shoplifting” Homer? Clearly, these artists create such connections in the hope their readers or listeners will appreciate their appropriation and deduce the larger meaning that is created by the fusion of material. By understanding these references, one can see how this video provides literary and filmic signposts for intertextuality. These highlight the various influences on the songwriter and his own attempts to fit his work into a

¹⁶ An analogous exercise that I often do is to bring in an early printed edition of the *Aeneid* that features [illustrations](#) and ask the students to interpret what they think is happening from the [illustrations](#) (especially from those books they *have not* read).

¹⁷ *VSD* stands for *Vita Suetonii vulgo Donatiana*, which is the life of Vergil that appears in Donatus’ commentary but may derive from Suetonius. Conte’s latest book on Vergilian imitation (*Stealing the Club from Hercules*) evokes this story.

line of particularly literate British pop songs as well as the British literary tradition, and these signposts can help students pick up on Latin intertextuality as well.

VERGIL'S INTERTEXTUAL POETICS

Articles and books about Vergilian intertextuality are widespread and have uncovered much about how Vergil read, understood, and redeployed the literary tradition.¹⁸ For my lesson, I try to detail how such signposts and incorporation of intertextual references imbue material that might seem rather trite with further significance. In “Paradise” the quotation of Iris Murdoch redefines the love scenario in the song and equates love much more strongly with forgiveness, not merely the lies we tell someone we meet at a club while dancing. When teaching Vergil’s *Aeneid* 8, I found that Vergil similarly enhances a moment that could be considered rather stale through such intertextual material. I often teach this book in a fourth semester Latin class and these lines appear near the start of the book, so this lesson often occurs early in the semester. I find it is a good introduction to the students to watch out for additional references within the work and to think about the notes (we use Gransden’s 1976 Cambridge commentary) as useful pointers to intertextual dialogue. This is the introduction to Aeneas in *Aeneid* 8:

*Talia per Latium. quae Laomedontius heros
cuncta videns magno curarum fluctuat aestu,
atque animum nunc huc celerem nunc dividit illuc
in partisque rapit varias perque omnia versat,
sicut aquae tremulum labris ubi lumen aënis
sole repercussum aut radiantis imagine lunae
omnia pervolitat late loca, iamque sub auras
erigitur summique ferit laquearia tecti.
Nox erat et terras animalia fessa per omnis
alituum pecudumque genus sopor altus habebat,
cum pater in ripa gelidique sub aetheris axe
Aeneas, tristi turbatus pectora bello,
procubuit seramque dedit per membra quietem.*

(Vergil, *Aen.* 8.18-30)

Such is the tally of Latium’s ills. Once Laomedon’s kinsman

¹⁸ Good places to start are Conte 1986, Farrell 1997, Thomas 1999, and Nelis 2010.

Drinks in this vision, the hero is swept on a swell of emotions,
 Scurrying thoughts into this or that channel of choice and decision,
 Surging in random directions, examining every perspective,
 Just as the shimmering light from a watery surface in bronze-lipped
 Cauldrons – itself but reflect sun, or the radiant, mirrored
 Face of the moon – ripples all round a room, leaps up through the yielding
 Air where it flickers on fretted beams paneled high on the ceiling.
 Night reigned; all across earth, sleep dulled living creatures' exhausted
 Consciousness, ruled all the various species of birds and of livestock.
 Under the cold sky's vault, on the river-bank, father Aeneas,
 Though sick at heart and confused by the outbreak of war and its grimness
 Lay down, permitting the rest he'd deferred to diffuse through his body.

(trans. Ahl, 2008)

A description of night. All the animals are asleep yet the hero cannot find rest. Both Seneca the Elder and Seneca the Younger remark that such descriptions of night are common rhetorical and poetic fodder, often overdone to the detriment of the author's reputation, and Gransden remarks that being "swept on a swell of emotions" is hackneyed (citing Aeschylus and Catullus).¹⁹ How does Vergil find a way to recuperate such generic material? In part he does so through intertextual and intratextual reinforcements. Vergil is a careful writer (and reader) and he carefully deploys language found in previous hexameter poets in this section to evoke the larger works of the Epicurean poet Lucretius and Apollonius of Rhodes. For instance, the collocation *alituum...genus* recalls Lucretius (5.801, 5.1039, 5.1078) and *per membra quietem* is found at Lucretius 4.907 where he writes how sleep cures anxieties. Intertexts to Lucretius do a variety of work in Vergil, here *alituum...genus* adds archaic flair to the description (like the Walkman in the video), and *per membra quietem* was found at a moment of Lucretius in which he urges his reader to pay attention to his language.²⁰ Does this admonition from the original context also lurk behind Aeneas' slumber? Should we also be paying particular attention to Vergil's appropriation of Lucretius' language? I ask my class whether this is one leap too far (after all, *per membra quietem* also appears at *Aen.* 1.691), but it is a move

19 Gransden 1976: ad loc. Sen. *Controv.* 7.1.27ff. and Sen. *Ep.* 122.11. Gransden underestimates how Vergil's use of this image for Dido at *Aen.* 4.522 complicates its employment here. The repetition actually points to numerous parallels between the scenes.

20 Bailey 1947: ad 909-11 remarks "The picturesque introduction followed by the emphatic appeal of the four following lines shows that Lucretius attaches great importance to this explanation of sleep."

that is not out of the realm of consideration for Augustan poets and interrogates the potential limits of intertextual hermeneutics.²¹ The question of how much of the source context to take into consideration is often debated in class – is Vergil also evoking Epicurean tenets through such Lucretian echoes and hinting at his own philosophical “affiliation”? I find that students enjoy considering what can be added to such interpretations through their own intertextual understanding of this material.²²

In addition, the intratextual repetition of *Aen.* 4.285-6 at *Aen.* 8.20-1 foreshadows the vision of the god, Tiberinus, and recalls Aeneas’ dalliance with Dido. Again, Vergil probably planned this (it is an allusion to his previous book), but readers can interpret it in a variety of ways (an extension of intertextuality). In *Aeneid* 4, these lines occur after Mercury appears to Aeneas and tells him to leave from Carthage, which incites the reader to compare the situations and characters involved. One may also think about the particularly “epic” resonance of such repetitions, which were common in Homer’s oral epics, but used sparingly in Vergil’s *Aeneid*.²³ It is notable that such repetition is also a constitutive element of pop music (with the refrain/chorus), and as the refrain of “Paradise” is ultimately redefined after the spoken word piece, so the repetition of Vergil’s own words in a new context will inevitably be altered in some manner.²⁴ Vergil always repeats himself for a reason and here the use of *versare* (*Aen.* 8.20) becomes charged with additional meaning as not only “turning back” to a previous roll of the text, but also a signpost of allusion and translation, which occurs with the subsequent Apollonius intertext.²⁵ Whereas

21 See, for instance, Thomas 1999: 227 where the Homeric and Callimachean contexts influence Vergil in such a way that “Homer’s Aeneas may be seen as already putting into action the Hesiodic-Callimachean program that poets claim for themselves. You do need your Homer to read the *Aeneid*, since Virgil constantly expects you to explore the original context and to observe its new life in his own poem.”

22 I often show them Silius’ *Pun.* 6.97, which also features this phrase and ask them if it is evoking Lucretius or Vergil or both (or neither) to help see how these phrases continue to resonate in Latin literature.

23 The very appearance of two identical lines from earlier in the *Aeneid* may itself act as a visual suggestion of the act of *imitatio* that Vergil is tackling.

24 For the repetition within pop songs, see Goodwin 1992: 79 “Repetition occurs at three levels – within songs, between songs, and across media sites. First, pop songs are based on the repetition of elements such as the verse and chorus within any given song, and on the repetition of lyrics, chord progressions, riffs, and rhythms.” These three levels *mutatis mutandis* may be seen in Latin poetry as well.

25 s.v. OLD 2b “to handle constantly (books or writing)” and OLD 7a “to vary the expression of (an idea).” The imagery that Vergil uses for thinking and “this or that channel of choice and decision” also touches upon language that Cicero used for dream interpretation and conjectures (*varias partis*,

most students understand the importance of Homer's epics for the *Aeneid*, the strong connections with Apollonius' *Argonautica*, especially the third and fourth books, are able to be introduced at this moment in the class. The famous simile of the light reflecting off water was, for Apollonius, indicative of Medea's worry for Jason (3.747ff.), whereas now Vergil exploits it for the political and military cares of Aeneas. The metrical grouping of lines *Aen.* 8.22-26 would also underline that Vergil wishes the reader (who would read aloud) to pay attention to this "carefully wrought passage."²⁶ However, the "further" voice of Apollonius, refracted through Dido's own Medea-like desire and disquiet (*Aen.* 4.522-32 describes a similar scene introduced with *nox erat* and concluding with *magnoque irarum fluctuat aestu*) shows how the rage and fury of Dido will be replayed in the war over Lavinia's hand.²⁷ In this way, the reader may intuit that Dido continues to haunt the epic, that their love could still be on Aeneas' mind, and that love will persist in being problematic for Aeneas and the epic as a whole (Putnam 1995: 27-49). In fact, one could infer this at the opening of *Aeneid* 7 and 8, where Vergil employs the uncommon verb *dido*, *-ere* with *rumor* (*Aen.* 7.144) and *fama* (*Aen.* 8.132) to continue to encourage the reader/listener to remember the Carthaginian queen.²⁸ As Lyne states, "Vergil shows us very pointedly that Aeneas repeats Dido's turmoil by giving him not only similar language and motifs but Dido's own allusive persona" (130). For the reader attuned to such intertextual and metaliterary reverberations, Aeneas' momentary insomnia during the witching hour blends echoes from various sources and characters, hinting at the discord and agony that stems from frustrated desires. While few would doubt that Vergil intended his audience to acknowledge his allusion to Apollonius' epic (and I would argue the metaliterary signposting is purposeful), it is up to the reader to diagnose how these connections create further ramifications for the epic. These connections can only find expression in the mind of the reader who is open to

Cic. *De Div.* 2.147).

26 Gransden 1976: 191-92 on the metrical "clusters" of Book 8. I think this would cause the reader to take notice and could be paralleled with beats and refrains from music. I often direct students interested in the sound of Latin poetry to the Barnard production of Seneca's *Thyestes* and tell them to think about the *quis...deorum* of *Thy.* 3 and Vergil's use of it when Aeneas addresses Palinurus in the underworld (6.341) – does Seneca enact the "return" signaled by Palin (πάλιν) -urus' name with the ghost of Tantalus here?

27 Note how Turnus' anger is compared to boiling water (*ira super...exsultantque aestu latites, furit intus...*, 7.460-66).

28 Gowers 2016 eloquently discusses the name of Dido but without drawing attention to the use of this verb.

hearing them recited aloud and seeing the words on the page. An intertextual reading of this passage highlights *how* the reader makes meaning through Vergil's text and *why* Vergil calls attention to his language in this manner.

CONCLUSION

The inclusion of the intertextual material will make the reader understand how love may be under the surface the second half of the *Aeneid* and help to point to the way that Erato is a fitting Muse for the second half of the *Aeneid* (*Aen.* 7.37, cf. Apollonius 3.1). Unlike in "Paradise" where love is refigured as forgiveness, love still haunts Vergil's Aeneas and evokes loneliness, misery, and violence for the characters who succumb to it in the epic. Johnson, Lyne, and Reed discuss what makes Apollonius important to this moment and that is the most apparent intertext,²⁹ but I would argue that the repetition of *Aeneid* 4.285-6 is particularly marked here and acts to call attention to the metapoetic potential of the word *versat*. As the flashes of the book cover in the video for "Paradise" take on additional meaning for those that explore the ramifications of Iris Murdoch for the song, so Vergil will often imbue language with additional expressive potential and hint at connections to be drawn. I have found the Wild Nothing video to be beneficial for teaching intertextuality and for encouraging students to probe Latin texts with an eye for their continual dialogue with previous works and authors. From a pedagogical standpoint, this method allows students to relate a complex Latin rhetorical practice to their everyday world without drawing directly on their knowledge of mythology or Roman history.³⁰ Students know countless lyrics by heart and can recognize the way that current hip hop or pop music manipulates their tradition, whether it is [Jay-Z](#) noting his own lyrical progress and how his lyricism differs from Common or Talib Kweli, or Belle and Sebastian dropping the title of a Bob Dylan documentary in their song "[Like Dylan in the Movies](#)." Music is to our students what poetry was to the educated Roman audience. By seeing the various ways that artists, even contemporary musicians, reference their influences and practice *aemulatio*, students come to view the Latin poets as, paradoxically, more creative, evocative, and (perhaps) "modern" in their compositional techniques and literary concerns.

29 Cf. Johnson 1976: 84-87, Lyne 1987: 125-32, and Reed 2007: 187-89.

30 Songs by Sunset Rubdown "[Apollo and the Buffalo and Anna Anna Oh!](#)" and the Mountain Goats "[Song for Cleomenes](#)" reference Anna Perenna and Gaius Verres, respectively. Bob Dylan's interactions with the Classics are well discussed in Thomas 2017.

WORKS CITED

- Ahl, Frederick. *Virgil: Aeneid*. Oxford: Oxford World's Classics, 2008.
- Bailey, Cyril. *Titi Lucreti Cari: De Rerum Natura Libri Sex*. 3 Vol. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1947.
- Baraz, Yelena, and Christopher S. van den Berg. "Introduction." *American Journal of Philology* 134 (2013): 1-8.
- Beebe, Roger. "Paradoxes of Pastiche: Spike Jonze, Hype Willimas, and the Race of the Postmodern Auteur." *Medium Cool: Music Videos from Soundies to Cellphones*. Ed. R. Beebe and J. Middleton. Durham: Duke University Press, 2007. 303-328.
- Blondell, Ruby. "'Third cheerleader from the left': from Homer's Helen to Helen of Troy." *Classical Receptions Journal* 1 (2009): 4-22.
- Conte, Gian Biagio. *The Rhetoric of Imitation: Genre and Poetic Memory in Virgil and Other Latin Poets*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1986.
- Conte, Gian Biagio. *Stealing the Club from Hercules: On Imitation in Latin Poetry*. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2017.
- Eco, Umberto. *The Role of the Reader: Explorations in the Semiotics of Texts*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1979.
- Edmunds, Lowell. *Intertextuality and the Reading of Roman Poetry*. Baltimore and London: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2001.
- Farrell, Joseph. "The Virgilian Intertext." *The Cambridge Companion to Virgil*. Ed. C. Martindale. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997. 222-238.
- Goodwin, Andrew. *Dancing in the Distraction Factory: Music Television and Popular Culture*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1992.
- Gowers, Emily. "Dido and the Owl." *Wordplay and Powerplay in Latin Poetry*. Ed. P. Mitsis and I. Ziogas. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter, 2016. 107-30.
- Gransden, K. W., editor. *Virgil: Aeneid 8*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1976.

- Harrison, Stephen J. *Generic Enrichment in Vergil and Horace*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007.
- Hinds, Stephen. *Allusion and Intertext: Dynamics of Appropriation in Roman Poetry*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998.
- Horsfall, Nicholas, editor. *Vergil, Aeneid 7: A Commentary*. Leiden: Brill, 2000.
- Horsfall, Nicholas, editor. *Vergil, Aeneid 11: A Commentary*. Leiden: Brill, 2003.
- Howard, C. E. "‘Only Connect’: Logical Aesthetic of Fragmentation in *A Word Child*." *Twentieth Century Literature* 38 (1992): 54-65.
- Hutchinson, G. O. *Greek to Latin: Frameworks and Contexts for Intertextuality*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013.
- Iser, Wolfgang. *The Act of Reading: A Theory of Aesthetic Response*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1980.
- Johnson, W. R. *Darkness Visible: A Study of Vergil's Aeneid*. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1976.
- Laird, Andrew. *Powers of Expression, Expressions of Power*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Lethem, Jonathan. *The Ecstasy of Influence: Nonfictions, Etc.* New York: Doubleday, 2011.
- Lyne, R. O. A. M. *Further Voices in Vergil's Aeneid*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1987.
- Murdoch, Iris. *A Word Child*. New York: The Viking Press, 1975.
- Nelis, Damien P. "Vergil's Library." *A Companion to Vergil's Aeneid and its Tradition*. Ed. J. Farrell and M. C. J. Putnam. Malden: Wiley-Blackwell, 2010. 13-25.
- Orr, Mary. *Intertextuality: Debates and Contexts*. Cambridge: Polity Press, 2003.
- Pucci, Joseph. *The Full-Knowing Reader: Allusion and the Power of the Reader in the Western Literary Tradition*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1998.

- Putnam, Michael C. J. *Virgil's Aeneid: Interpretation and Influence*. Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1995.
- Railton, Diane and Watson, Paul. *Music Video and the Politics of Representation*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2011.
- Reed, Jay D. *Virgil's Gaze*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2007.
- Reiss, Steven. *Thirty Frames Per Second: The Visionary Art of the Music Video*. New York: Harry N. Abrams, Inc., 2000.
- Robbins, Michael. *Equipment for Living: On Poetry and Pop Music*. New York: Simon & Schuster, 2017.
- Rollason, Christopher. "‘Tell-Tale Signs’ – Edgar Allan Poe and Bob Dylan: Towards a Model of Intertextuality." *Atlantis* 31 (2009): 41-56.
- Slatkin, Laura M. *The Power of Thetis: Allusion and Interpretation in the Iliad*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995.
- Thomas, Richard F. *Reading Virgil and His Texts: Studies in Intertextuality*. Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 1999.
- Thomas, Richard F. *Why Bob Dylan Matters*. New York: Harper Collins, 2017.
- Vernallis, C. *Experiencing Music Video: Aesthetics and Cultural Context*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2004.
- West, D. and Woodman, A., eds. *Creative Imitation and Latin Literature*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979.
- Williams, Justin A. "Theoretical Approaches to Quotation in Hip-Hop Recordings." *Contemporary Music Review* 33 (2014): 188-209.
- Worton, Michael and Still, Judith. *Intertextuality: Theories and Practices*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1990.

MODERN MEDIA CITED

- Beastie Boys. "[Sabotage](#)" (Official Music Video). Directed by Spike Jonze. 2009.

- Belle & Sebastian. "Like Dylan in the Movies." *If You're Feeling Sinister*. Jeepster. 1996.
- Björk. "[It's Oh So Quiet](#)" (Official Music Video). Directed by Spike Jonze. 1995.
- DJ Danger Mouse. *The Grey Album*. 2004.
- Duran Duran. "Hungry Like the Wolf." *Rio*. Parlophone Records. 2009 [remastered version].
- The Human League. "[Don't You Want Me](#)" (Official Music Video). Directed by Steve Barron. 1981.
- Jay-Z. "Moment of Clarity." *The Black Album*. Roc-A-Fella Records. 2003.
- Jay-Z and Kanye West. "[No Church in the Wild](#)." *Watch the Throne*. Roc-A-Fella Records. 2011.
- Metzger, Patrick. "[Crying in the Club](#): Songs within Songs and Intertextuality in Pop Music." *The Patterning: Dedicated to identifying patterns in music, culture, and the universe*.
- The Mountain Goats. "Song for Cleomenes." *Beautiful Rat Sunset*. Shrimper. 1994.
- New Order. "[Bizarre Love Triangle](#)" (Official Music Video). Directed by Robert Longo. 1986.
- The Psychedelic Furs. "[Love My Way](#)" (Official Music Video). Directed by Tim Pope. 1982.
- Red Hot Chili Peppers. "[Dani California](#)" (Official Music Video). Directed by Tony Kaye. 2006.
- The Smiths. "Shoplifters of the World United." Rough Trade Records. 1987.
- The Smiths. "Cemetery Gates." *The Queen is Dead*, Rough Trade Records. 1986.
- Sunset Rubdown. "Apollo and the Buffalo and Anna Anna Anna Oh!" *Dragonslayer*. Jagjaguwar. 2009.
- Taylor Swift. "Love Story." *Fearless*. Big Machine Records. 2008.
- Wild Nothing. "[Paradise](#)" (Official Music Video). Directed by Matt Amato. 2012.